

Post-Conviction Relief for Immigrants

Summary Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	i
Preface.....	iii
Table of Abbreviations	v
Summary Table of Contents	vii
Detailed Table of Contents	ix
Chapter 1 Introduction and Overview	1
Chapter 2 Evaluating the Chances of Obtaining Relief	13
Chapter 3 Investigating the Case	43
Chapter 4 Obtaining an Effective Post-Conviction Order	71
Chapter 5 Vehicles for Vacating the Conviction	99
Chapter 6 Grounds for Vacating the Conviction	183
Chapter 7 Vacating or Reducing the Sentence	297
Chapter 8 State Rehabilitative Relief	413
Chapter 9 Practical Considerations	455
Chapter 10 After the Conviction has been Vacated	481
Appendix 1 Post-Conviction Evaluation Checklist	507
Appendix 2 AEDPA Statute of Limitations Worksheet	509
Appendix 3 Intake Form	511
Appendix 4 Basic Immigration Status Questionnaire	515
Table of Authorities	517
Index	581

Other Resources:

Publications Order Form from Law Offices of Norton Tooby
 Www.CriminalAndImmigrationLaw.com Website Description
 Immigrant Legal Resource Center (ILRC) CALIFORNIA CRIMINAL
 LAW AND IMMIGRATION Order Form
 ILRC Consultation Services Description
 National Lawyers Guild IMMIGRATION LAW AND CRIMES Order Form
 AILA IMMIGRATION CONSEQUENCES OF CRIMINAL ACTIVITY Order Form

About the Author

Post-Conviction Relief for Immigrants

Detailed Table of Contents

Chapter One:

Introduction and Overview.....1

§ 1.1	I.	Origins of the Problem.....	1
§ 1.2	II.	The Challenge of Obtaining Post-Conviction Relief	2
§ 1.3	III.	Outline of This Volume	3
§ 1.4	IV.	Overview of Post-Conviction Relief	4
§ 1.5	V.	Introduction to Immigration Law for Criminal Lawyers ...	6
§ 1.6	VI.	Other Resources.....	11

Chapter Two:

Evaluating the Chances of Obtaining Post-Conviction Relief13

§ 2.1	I.	Identifying Winnable Cases: Introduction and Overview.....	15
§ 2.2	II.	A Triage Guide to Post-Conviction Cases.....	15
§ 2.3	A.	The Current Status of the Client.....	16
§ 2.4	1.	The Client Is Clean and Sober	17
§ 2.5	2.	The Client Has Strong Equities.....	18
§ 2.6	3.	The Client Has Served the Sentence and Is Now Out of Custody	21
§ 2.7	4.	The Client Has No Outstanding or Potential Arrest Warrants	21
§ 2.8	5.	The Client Has No Current Aggravated Re-entry Exposure.....	22
§ 2.9	6.	The Client is Lawfully Present in the United States	23
§ 2.10	B.	The Criminal Situation	23
§ 2.11	1.	A Small Criminal Case Has Large Immigration Effects	23
§ 2.12	2.	The Client Has One or Few Damaging Convictions	25

§ 2.13	3.	Number and Diversity of Original Charges	26
§ 2.14	4.	The Evidence of Guilt is Weak, or the Client Has a Plausible Claim of (at Least Partial) Innocence	27
§ 2.15	5.	The Client Was Charged Jointly With One or More Codefendants	27
§ 2.16	6.	A Relatively Minor Change in Conviction or Sentence Will Solve the Immigration Problem.....	28
§ 2.17	7.	There is Small Risk the Client Will Receive Additional Time in Custody if the Case is Reopened and the Client is Reconvicted.....	30
§ 2.18	a.	Adverse Criminal Consequences	30
§ 2.19	b.	Adverse Immigration Consequences.....	31
§ 2.20	8.	The Jurisdiction Where the Conviction Occurred is Relatively Sympathetic	32
§ 2.21	9.	Incomplete Initial Defense Investigation	32
§ 2.22	10.	Technical Problems with Prosecution Case	33
§ 2.23	C.	Timing of the Case.....	34
§ 2.24	1.	Federal Time Limits	34
§ 2.25	a.	Motion to Vacate Sentence Under § 2255....	34
§ 2.26	b.	<i>Coram Nobis</i> Time Limits	35
§ 2.27	c.	Attacking State Convictions.....	36
§ 2.28	2.	Time Limits Within Which Actions for State Post-Conviction Relief Must be Filed.....	37
§ 2.29	a.	California Habeas Corpus and Nonstatutory Constitutional Motion to Vacate	37
§ 2.30	b.	California <i>Coram Nobis</i>	38
§ 2.31	c.	California Motion to Vacate Conviction for Violation of Penal Code § 1016.5	38
§ 2.32	d.	Expungement Pursuant to California Penal Code § 1203.4(a)	39
§ 2.33	e.	California Motion to Reduce Felony to Misdemeanor	39
§ 2.34	3.	The Client Has Six Months or More Before Irrevocable Immigration Damage Occurs	39
§ 2.35	4.	There is Still Time To Reopen the	

	Immigration Case if Criminal Convictions Are Eliminated	40
§ 2.36	5. The Records Necessary to Establish Error in the Criminal Case Still Exist.....	41

Chapter Three:

Investigating the Case43

§ 3.1	I. Investigating the Case.....	44
§ 3.2	II. Interviewing the Client	44
§ 3.3	A. Special Considerations	44
§ 3.4	B. Non-English Speaking Clients	45
§ 3.5	III. Obtaining Information About Immigration Status	46
§ 3.6	A. Check for Unknown U.S. Citizenship.....	48
§ 3.7	B. Inform the Client of Illegal Re-entry Exposure	48
§ 3.8	IV. Obtaining Information on “Equities” or Reasons Client Should be Allowed to Remain in the U.S.....	48
§ 3.9	V. Obtaining Information About the Criminal Case	49
§ 3.10	A. Determining Which Criminal History Reports to Order	49
§ 3.11	B. Discovering How the Conviction Came About and Possible Grounds to Vacate.....	50
§ 3.12	C. The Basic Criminal Case Interview.....	52
§ 3.13	VI. Corroborating the Client’s Assertions of Prejudice.....	52
§ 3.14	VII. Verifying the Immigration Situation: INS Records, FOIA Requests, and Analysis.....	59
§ 3.15	A. Filing an FOIA Request	59
§ 3.16	B. Information on Amnesty Clients	60
§ 3.17	VIII. Verifying Exact Criminal History: Criminal Records and “Rap Sheets”	60
§ 3.18	A. Obtaining the Client’s FBI Criminal Record	61
§ 3.19	B. Obtaining the Client’s State Criminal Record.....	62
§ 3.20	C. Obtaining DMV Conviction Records.....	62
§ 3.21	IX. Correcting Errors in Criminal Histories	63
§ 3.22	A. Correcting Errors in FBI Criminal History Reports.....	63
§ 3.23	B. Correcting California State Criminal History	

	Records	64
§ 3.24	X. Official Destruction of Conviction Records Does Not Remove the Convictions Themselves	64
§ 3.25	XI. Obtaining Conviction Records and Transcripts from the Rendering Court	65
§ 3.26	XII. Obtaining the Case File From Original Defense Counsel.....	67
§ 3.27	XIII. Ineffective Assistance: Interviewing Original Defense Counsel	67

Chapter Four:

Effective Post-Conviction Relief: Eliminating Criminal Convictions and Sentences for Immigration Purposes..... 71

§ 4.1	I. Introduction: Scope of the Chapter	72
§ 4.2	II. Obtaining an Order Vacating a Criminal Conviction that the Immigration Authorities Will Respect.....	72
§ 4.3	A. A Legally Invalid Conviction Cannot Trigger Immigration Consequences	73
§ 4.4	1. The Long-Standing Rule	73
§ 4.5	2. The New IIRAIRA Definition of Conviction and <i>Matter of Pickering</i> Did Not Change the Basic Rule.....	75
§ 4.6	3. An Order Vacating a Conviction as Legally Invalid Eliminates the Conviction for All Immigration Purposes.....	87
§ 4.7	4. Reopening Removal Proceedings After a Conviction Has been Vacated	88
§ 4.8	B. A Conviction Vacated on Purely Humanitarian Grounds, or Under a State Rehabilitative Statute, May Continue to Exist for Immigration Purposes...	89
§ 4.9	1. Humanitarian Grounds	90
§ 4.10	2. State Rehabilitative Statutes	92
§ 4.11	C. The Immigration Authorities Cannot Collaterally Attack, in Immigration Court, the Validity of a Criminal Court Order Vacating a Conviction.....	95
§ 4.12	D. The Government Argument That An Order	

Vacating a Conviction is Beyond the Jurisdiction
of the Criminal Court Should Not Be Accepted97

**Chapter Five:
Vehicles for Vacating a Conviction.....99**

§ 5.1	I.	Introduction: Three Requirements for Successful Post-Conviction Relief.....102	102
§ 5.2	A.	Practical Requirements.....104	104
§ 5.3	1.	Matching the Vehicle to the Immigration Effect105	105
§ 5.4	2.	Matching the Vehicle to the Ground of Legal Invalidity106	106
§ 5.5	3.	Choosing a Vehicle that Works106	106
§ 5.6	4.	Timing of Post-Conviction Relief.....106	106
§ 5.7	B.	General Considerations108	108
§ 5.8	1.	Developing a Strategy108	108
§ 5.9	2.	Obtaining the Relief: General Procedure and Approach110	110
§ 5.10	3.	Tension Between Strength of Ground and Equities.....111	111
§ 5.11	4.	Adverse Criminal Consequences of Setting Aside Conviction.....111	111
§ 5.12	5.	Vacating a Conviction Will Not Avoid Conduct-Based Immigration Consequences ..112	112
§ 5.13	6.	<i>Ex Post Facto</i> Laws and Obtaining the Benefit of Changes in the Law.....113	113
§ 5.14	II.	Federal Vehicles for Vacating a Conviction114	114
§ 5.15	A.	Motion to Withdraw Plea114	114
§ 5.16	1.	Procedural Requirements114	114
§ 5.17	2.	Grounds115	115
§ 5.18	3.	Immigration Consequences.....115	115
§ 5.19	B.	Direct Appeal.....115	115
§ 5.20	1.	Procedural Requirements117	117
§ 5.21	2.	Filing a Late Notice of Appeal.....118	118
§ 5.22	3.	Attacking a Waiver of Appeal120	120
§ 5.23	4.	Immigration Consequences.....121	121

§ 5.24	a.	Effect of Reversal of Conviction.....	121
§ 5.25	b.	Finality Of Decision	122
§ 5.26	5.	Negotiating a Better Result On Appeal.....	123
§ 5.27	C.	Habeas Corpus	124
§ 5.28	1.	General Requirements.....	125
§ 5.29	2.	Federal Habeas Corpus.....	126
§ 5.30	3.	The Petition Must Be Timely Filed.....	127
§ 5.31	a.	Federal Habeas Corpus and the AEDPA Statute of Limitations.....	128
§ 5.32	i.	The Starting Date	128
§ 5.33	ii.	Statutory Tolling	130
§ 5.34	iii.	Equitable Tolling	132
§ 5.35	4.	The Requirement Of Custody.....	133
§ 5.36	a.	Registration Requirements as Custody .	135
§ 5.37	b.	Immigration Custody	136
§ 5.38	c.	Mootness	141
§ 5.39	5.	Procedure	145
§ 5.40	6.	Immigration Consequences	146
§ 5.41	D.	<i>Coram Nobis</i>	146
§ 5.42	1.	Procedure	146
§ 5.43	2.	Grounds	147
§ 5.44	3.	Immigration Consequences	149
§ 5.45	E.	<i>Audita Querela</i>	150
§ 5.46	F.	All Writs Act.....	152
§ 5.47	III.	State Vehicles for Vacating a Conviction.....	153
§ 5.48	A.	Motion to Withdraw Plea.....	154
§ 5.49	1.	Motions Prior to Judgment	155
§ 5.50	a.	Procedure.....	155
§ 5.51	b.	Grounds	156
§ 5.52	c.	Immigration Consequences	156
§ 5.53	2.	Motions After Judgment.....	157
§ 5.54	a.	Procedure.....	157
§ 5.55	b.	Grounds	157
§ 5.56	c.	Immigration Consequences	158
§ 5.57	B.	Motion to Vacate for Violation of State Advisal Statute	158
§ 5.58	1.	Procedure	160
§ 5.59	2.	Grounds	162

§ 5.60	3. Immigration Consequences.....	165
§ 5.61	C. Nonstatutory Motion to Vacate	165
§ 5.62	1. Nature of the Motion.....	166
§ 5.63	2. Procedure.....	167
§ 5.64	3. Immigration Consequences.....	167
§ 5.65	D. Direct Appeal.....	167
§ 5.66	1. Procedural Requirements	168
§ 5.67	2. Filing a Late Notice of Appeal.....	169
§ 5.68	3. Attacking a Waiver of Appeal	169
§ 5.69	4. Immigration Consequences.....	171
§ 5.70	a. Effect of Reversal of Conviction	171
§ 5.71	b. Finality Of Decision.....	171
§ 5.72	E. Habeas Corpus and Post-Conviction Relief Petitions	173
§ 5.73	1. General Requirements for Issuance.....	174
§ 5.74	2. Timeliness	174
§ 5.75	3. The Requirement of Custody	175
§ 5.76	4. Procedure.....	176
§ 5.77	5. Immigration Consequences.....	176
§ 5.78	F. <i>Coram Nobis</i>	177
§ 5.79	1. Procedure.....	177
§ 5.80	2. Grounds	179
§ 5.81	3. Immigration Consequences.....	181
§ 5.82	G. <i>Audita Querela</i>	181

Chapter Six:

Grounds for Vacating the Conviction.....183

§ 6.1	I. Geography of the Field	185
§ 6.2	II. Violations of the Right to Counsel	186
§ 6.3	A. Denial of Counsel	186
§ 6.4	1. Representation by Non-Counsel	188
§ 6.5	2. Invalid Waiver of Right to Counsel	189
§ 6.6	3. Refusal to Allow Self-Representation.....	196
§ 6.7	B. Ineffective Assistance of Counsel	197
§ 6.8	1. Generally — Deficient Performance and Prejudice.....	198

§ 6.9	2.	Failure to Conduct Competent Investigation of the Facts.....	201
§ 6.10	3.	Failure to Research the Law	204
§ 6.11	4.	Failure to Advise the Defendant of the Elements and Defenses.....	206
§ 6.12	5.	Failure to Advise the Defendant of Constitutional Rights at Plea	207
§ 6.13	6.	Failure to Assist the Defendant to Withdraw the Plea	207
§ 6.14	7.	Failure to Consult the Defendant about an Appeal.....	208
§ 6.15	8.	Ineffective Assistance of Counsel on Appeal ...	210
§ 6.16	C.	Failure to Protect the Defendant Against the Immigration Consequences of the Plea	212
§ 6.17	1.	Deficient Performance.....	212
§ 6.18	2.	Misadvice vs. Failure to Advise	215
§ 6.19	3.	Prejudice	219
§ 6.20	4.	The Collateral Consequences Argument.....	225
§ 6.21	a.	California Rejects the Collateral Consequences Bar	227
§ 6.22	b.	Further Arguments and Authority	229
§ 6.23	5.	Affirmative Misadvice May Circumvent the Collateral Consequences Argument	235
§ 6.24	6.	Failure to Investigate Mitigating Facts.....	237
§ 6.25	a.	Basic Approach	237
§ 6.26	b.	Sample Argument.....	237
§ 6.27	7.	Failure to Investigate the Immigration Consequences of Trial	240
§ 6.28	D.	Conflict of Interest	241
§ 6.29	1.	Multiple Representation of Conflicting Interests.....	242
§ 6.30	2.	Conflict of Interest in Failing to Raise Counsel's Own Ineffectiveness	246
§ 6.31	3.	Conflict Between Defendant and Counsel ...	248
§ 6.32	III.	Invalid Guilty Pleas.....	248
§ 6.33	A.	Ineffective Waiver of Jury Trial	250
§ 6.34	1.	The Failure to Explain the Nature of the Right to a Jury Trial.....	252

§ 6.35	2.	Involuntary Waiver of the Right to a Jury Trial	255
§ 6.36	B.	Ineffective Waiver of Right to Remain Silent.....	255
§ 6.37	C.	Ineffective Waiver of Confrontation	258
§ 6.38	D.	Failure to Establish Factual Basis	258
§ 6.39	E.	Failure to Inform Defendant of the Nature of the Offense.....	259
§ 6.40	F.	Failure to Inform Defendant of Consequences of Plea.....	263
§ 6.41	G.	Breach of Plea Bargain.....	265
§ 6.42	H.	Promissory Estoppel.....	267
§ 6.43	I.	Failure to Disclose Plea Agreement on the Record.....	269
§ 6.44	J.	Coercion to Enter Plea.....	271
§ 6.45	K.	Failure to Establish Mental Competence to Enter Plea.....	276
§ 6.46	L.	Failure to Advise the Noncitizen Defendant of the Right to Contact the Consulate.....	280
§ 6.47	IV.	Violations of the Right to an Interpreter.....	281
§ 6.48	A.	The Right to an Interpreter in Criminal Proceedings.....	282
§ 6.49	B.	Grounds for Invalidating Conviction for Violation of the Right to an Interpreter	283
§ 6.50	V.	Other Grounds For Vacating Guilty Pleas.....	290
§ 6.51	A.	Jurisdictional Defects	291
§ 6.52	B.	Newly Discovered Evidence	291
§ 6.53	C.	Prosecution Withholding of Exculpatory Evidence	292
§ 6.54	D.	Actual Innocence	294
§ 6.55	E.	Failure of Charge to State All Elements of Offense.....	294
§ 6.56	F.	Other Grounds to Vacate Guilty Pleas	295
§ 6.57	IV.	State Advisal Statute Violations	295

Chapter Seven:**Vacating or Reducing the Sentence..... 297**

§ 7.1	I.	Introduction.....	303
§ 7.2	II.	Immigration Consequences of Sentence.....	304
§ 7.3	A.	Definition of “Sentence Imposed”.....	305
§ 7.4	B.	Length of “Sentence Imposed”.....	306
§ 7.5	1.	Aggravated Felonies Requiring One-Year “Sentence Imposed”.....	308
§ 7.6	a.	The One-Year List.....	309
§ 7.7	b.	Reduction of Sentence Below One Year.....	310
§ 7.8	2.	Petty Offense Exception to Inadmissibility Requires Sentence Imposed of Six Months or Less.....	310
§ 7.9	a.	Petty Offense Exception Generally.....	311
§ 7.10	b.	Effects of Petty Offense Exception in Specific Immigration Contexts.....	311
§ 7.11	3.	A Noncitizen Becomes Inadmissible if Convicted of Two or More Offenses for Which the Aggregate Sentences to Confinement Totaled Five Years or More	314
§ 7.12	4.	Mandatory Detention is Triggered if a Noncitizen is Deportable for One Conviction of a Crime of Moral Turpitude for Which a Sentence of One Year or More Has Been Imposed.....	315
§ 7.13	5.	Restriction on Removal (Formerly Withholding of Deportation) Requires a Noncitizen to Avoid an Aggregate Sentence of Five Years or More for Aggravated Felony Conviction(s).....	315
§ 7.14	6.	A Conviction is Considered a Misdemeanor, for Purposes of Adjustment of Status, if the State Designates It as a Misdemeanor and the Sentence Imposed is One Year or Less, Even If the Maximum Sentence is Greater ...	316
§ 7.15	C.	Length of Actual Confinement.....	317

§ 7.16	1.	To Be Eligible for the Waiver of Deportability Under Former INA § 212(c), the Noncitizen Must Avoid Service of Five Actual Years or More in Custody for Aggravated Felony Conviction(s).....	318
§ 7.17	2.	A Noncitizen is Disqualified from Showing Good Moral Character if Actually Confined as a Result of Criminal Convictions for a Total of 180 Days or More.....	319
§ 7.18	3.	Situations That Require Good Moral Character	320
§ 7.19	D.	Naturalization May Not Be Granted if the Applicant is Currently on Probation or Parole	321
§ 7.20	E.	The Sentencing Judgment, Which Forms Part of the “Record of Conviction,” Can Lead to Adverse Immigration Consequences.....	322
§ 7.21	F.	Immigration Consequences of Reducing the Level of the Offense from Felony to Misdemeanor	323
§ 7.22	1.	The Most Recent Sentence Determines the Immigration Consequences of the Conviction.....	324
§ 7.23	2.	The Felony/Misdemeanor Distinction in Immigration Law	325
§ 7.24	3.	Some Crimes of Violence are Aggravated Felonies Only if the Conviction is a Felony ..	326
§ 7.25	4.	A State First-Offense Controlled Substances Possession Conviction Must Be a Felony in Order to Be Considered an Aggravated Felony	328
§ 7.26	5.	Felony-Misdemeanor Offenses that are Treated As, or Reduced To Misdemeanor Offenses Do Not Constitute Aggravated Felonies as Long as They Would Be Misdemeanors Under Federal Law	331
§ 7.27	6.	One Felony Conviction Disqualifies an Immigrant from Eligibility for a Number of Immigration Benefits	333
§ 7.28	a.	The Legalization Program	333

§ 7.29	b.	“Special Agricultural Worker” (SAW) Legalization Program	333
§ 7.30	c.	Family Unity Program.....	334
§ 7.31	d.	Temporary Protected Status	334
§ 7.32	e.	Political Asylum.....	335
§ 7.33	f.	Restriction on Removal, Formerly Withholding of Deportation	335
§ 7.34	7.	Effect of a Felony Conviction on Criminal Sentences	335
§ 7.35	G.	Reduction of Maximum Sentence To or Below One Year	335
§ 7.36	1.	Petty Offense Exception	336
§ 7.37	a.	Admissibility; the Ability to Enter the United States	337
§ 7.38	b.	Cancellation of Removal for Lawful Permanent Residents	337
§ 7.39	c.	Cancellation of Removal for Non-Lawful Permanent Residents	337
§ 7.40	d.	Good Moral Character.....	338
§ 7.41	e.	Lawful Permanent Resident Status	338
§ 7.42	f.	Naturalization	338
§ 7.43	g.	Registry	338
§ 7.44	h.	Suspension of Deportation	339
§ 7.45	i.	Violence Against Women Act	339
§ 7.46	j.	Voluntary Departure at End of Removal Proceedings.....	339
§ 7.47	k.	Reduction from Felony to Misdemeanor Changes Maximum Sentence to One Year, Qualifying for the Petty Offense Exception.....	340
§ 7.48	2.	Reduction of Maximum Sentence Below One Year to Avoid Removal for One Conviction of a Crime of Moral Turpitude ...	340
§ 7.49	3.	Alphabetical Checklist of Applicable Immigration Contexts.....	341
§ 7.50	III.	Obtaining an Effective Order Vacating or Reducing a Sentence	342
§ 7.51	A.	Vacating the Conviction Vacates the Sentence	343

§ 7.52	B.	Vacating the Original Sentence on a Ground of Legal Invalidity	344
§ 7.53	C.	Obtaining an Order Modifying the Original Sentence.....	346
§ 7.54	D.	Modifying a Sentence Under a State Rehabilitative Statute.....	348
§ 7.55	IV.	Procedural Vehicles for Vacating or Reducing the Sentence	349
§ 7.56	A.	Direct Appeal from Sentence	349
§ 7.57	B.	Petition for Writ of Habeas Corpus.....	351
§ 7.58	C.	Non-Statutory Motion to Vacate Sentence.....	352
§ 7.59	D.	Petition for a Writ of Error <i>Coram Nobis</i>	352
§ 7.60	E.	Motion to Correct Void Sentence.....	353
§ 7.61	F.	Commutation or Correction of Sentence.....	354
§ 7.62	G.	Motion to Modify Probationary Sentence.....	354
§ 7.63	H.	Motion to Shorten Probation	354
§ 7.64	I.	Shortening Parole	355
§ 7.65	V.	Grounds to Vacate the Sentence	356
§ 7.66	A.	Choice of Ground	356
§ 7.67	1.	Any Ground Will Do.....	357
§ 7.68	2.	Immigration-Related Grounds	357
§ 7.69	3.	Non-Immigration Related Grounds	358
§ 7.70	B.	Relationship Between Grounds to Vacate Convictions and Grounds to Vacate Sentence	358
§ 7.71	1.	Vacating Conviction Vacates Sentence	358
§ 7.72	2.	Many Conviction Grounds Apply at Sentence	358
§ 7.73	3.	Court Must Reaffirm Validity of Plea at Time of Sentence.....	359
§ 7.74	C.	Violations of the Right to Counsel	360
§ 7.75	1.	The Right to Counsel	361
§ 7.76	2.	Ineffective Assistance of Counsel.....	361
§ 7.77	3.	Immigration-Related Ineffective Assistance..	362
§ 7.78	a.	Failure to Investigate the Facts	370
§ 7.79	b.	Failure to Present Mitigating Information	371
§ 7.80	c.	Failure to Research the Law	372
§ 7.81	d.	Failure to Correct Error of Fact or Law ...	372

§ 7.82	e.	Failure to Assist in Withdrawal of Plea ..	373
§ 7.83	f.	Failure to Advise About Appeal	373
§ 7.84	4.	Examples of IAC Concerning Immigration Consequences of Sentence	373
§ 7.85	a.	Moral Turpitude Offenses	373
§ 7.86	b.	Length of Sentence of Incarceration	374
§ 7.87	c.	Aggravated Felonies.....	374
§ 7.88	d.	Anticipating Post-Conviction Relief.....	375
§ 7.89	e.	Other Examples	376
§ 7.90	5.	Other Examples	376
§ 7.91	D.	Substantive Constitutional Guarantees	377
§ 7.92	1.	Cruel or Unusual Punishment.....	377
§ 7.93	2.	Unconstitutionally Vague Sentence Statute ..	377
§ 7.94	3.	<i>Ex Post Facto</i> Violations.....	377
§ 7.95	4.	Vindictive Sentencing	378
§ 7.96	5.	Withholding of Exculpatory Evidence	380
§ 7.97	6.	Breach of Plea Agreement at Sentence	381
§ 7.98	7.	Other Guarantees	383
§ 7.99	E.	Due Process Rights in the Sentencing Hearing	383
§ 7.100	1.	Right to Jury Determination of Facts Increasing Maximum Sentence	383
§ 7.101	2.	Judicial Awareness of Discretion	384
§ 7.102	3.	Notice and Opportunity to Be Heard.....	384
§ 7.103	4.	Allocution	385
§ 7.104	5.	Right to Accurate Information	387
§ 7.105	6.	Right Against Use of Unreliable Hearsay	389
§ 7.106	7.	Right Against Use of Improper Evidence	389
§ 7.107	8.	Improper Victim Impact Evidence	391
§ 7.108	9.	Prosecutorial Misconduct	392
§ 7.109	10.	Right to Individualized Consideration	395
§ 7.110	11.	Mental Incompetence at Sentence	395
§ 7.111	12.	Judicial Bias or Misconduct	395
§ 7.112	13.	Exclusion of Relevant Information	396
§ 7.113	14.	Other Due Process Violations	397
§ 7.114	F.	Other Sentence Defects.....	397
§ 7.115	1.	Invalid Prior Conviction	397
§ 7.116	2.	Illegal Sentence.....	399
§ 7.117	3.	Lack of Presentence Report.....	400

§ 7.118	4. Unreasonable Delay in Imposition of Sentence	400
§ 7.119	5. Other Sentence Defects	401
§ 7.120	VI. Post-Conviction Reduction of Felony to Misdemeanor	401
§ 7.121	A. Motion to Reduce a Felony to a Misdemeanor	401
§ 7.122	1. Basic Requirements	402
§ 7.123	2. Definition of Reducible Offenses	402
§ 7.124	3. The Required Sentence	404
§ 7.125	a. Generally	404
§ 7.126	b. A Sentence to State Prison — Even if Execution Is Suspended — Disqualifies the Defendant from Reducing the Offense to a Misdemeanor	405
§ 7.127	4. Standard for Granting the Reduction	405
§ 7.128	5. Procedure	406
§ 7.129	6. Timing of the Motion	406
§ 7.130	7. The Court’s Jurisdiction to Grant a Motion to Reduce Continues After the Termination of Probation	407
§ 7.131	8. The Court’s Jurisdiction to Grant a Motion to Reduce Continues After the Conviction Has Been Expunged	407
§ 7.132	9. Review of Grant or Denial of Motion to Reduce	408
§ 7.133	VII. Motion to Reduce a Misdemeanor to an Infraction	409
§ 7.134	A. Definition of Misdemeanor Conviction	409
§ 7.135	B. Immigration Contexts in Which the Client Benefits from Reducing Misdemeanors to Infractions	410
§ 7.136	C. Criminal Benefits of Reducing Misdemeanors to Infractions	411
§ 7.137	D. Motion Under California Penal Code § 17(d) to Reduce Certain Misdemeanors to Infractions	411

Chapter Eight:**State Rehabilitative Relief..... 413**

§ 8.1	I.	Introduction.....	415
§ 8.2	II.	Immigration Effects of State Rehabilitative Relief.....	415
§ 8.3	A.	General Rule: State Rehabilitative Relief Does Not Eliminate the Immigration Consequences of a Conviction.....	416
§ 8.4	B.	Exception: Federal First Offender Act	418
§ 8.5	C.	Exception: State FFOA Analogues in the Ninth Circuit	420
§ 8.6	1.	Qualifying Offenses.....	420
§ 8.7	2.	Qualifying Types of Relief.....	421
§ 8.8	3.	Disqualification from Effectiveness of Relief	422
§ 8.9	4.	Multiple Simultaneous Qualifying Convictions.....	423
§ 8.10	D.	Exception: Foreign FFOA Analogues in the Ninth Circuit	423
§ 8.11	E.	Prospects for this Rule in Other Circuits	424
§ 8.12	F.	Even Where State Rehabilitative Relief is Effective to Eliminate a Conviction, the Underlying Conduct Can be Considered as a Negative Discretionary Factor.....	425
§ 8.13	III.	Protecting the Client Before Relief is Available	425
§ 8.14	A.	Immigration Court	426
§ 8.15	1.	Obtaining a Continuance	426
§ 8.16	2.	Seeking Appellate Review	428
§ 8.17	B.	Criminal Court.....	428
§ 8.18	1.	Avoiding a Final Conviction	428
§ 8.19	2.	Expediting Rehabilitative Relief	429
§ 8.20	IV.	Rehabilitative Relief in Different Jurisdictions	430
§ 8.21	V.	Judicial Recommendations Against Deportation.....	431
§ 8.22	A.	Immigration Effects	432
§ 8.23	1.	Deportation Grounds Excused.....	432
§ 8.24	2.	Varieties of Immigration Effects.....	433
§ 8.25	3.	Foreign JRADs Ineffective.....	435
§ 8.26	4.	Continuing Validity of Pre-1990 JRADs	435

§ 8.27	B.	Procedure	435
§ 8.28	1.	Notice to Immigration Authorities	436
§ 8.29	2.	Timing of Effective JRAD	437
§ 8.30	C.	Ineffective Assistance of Counsel in Failing to Seek JRAD	438
§ 8.31	1.	Ground to Vacate Sentence	439
§ 8.32	2.	Remedy to Allow Timely JRAD	441
§ 8.33	D.	Retroactivity of Repeal of JRAD Authority	442
§ 8.34	1.	Effective Date of Repeal	442
§ 8.35	2.	Congressional Intent in Light of <i>St. Cyr</i>	442
§ 8.36	3.	<i>Ex Post Facto</i> Argument	442
§ 8.37	E.	Government May Not Attack Validity of JRAD in Immigration Court	443
§ 8.38	VI.	Executive Pardon	445
§ 8.39	A.	Immigration Effects of a Pardon	445
§ 8.40	1.	Qualifying Deportation Grounds	446
§ 8.41	2.	Immigration Benefits	447
§ 8.42	3.	Nature of Effective Pardon	447
§ 8.43	4.	Foreign Pardons Ineffective	450
§ 8.44	B.	Experience in Particular States	451

Chapter Nine:

Practical Considerations455

§ 9.1	I.	Introduction.....	456
§ 9.2	II.	Dealing with Bias Against Immigrants	457
§ 9.3	A.	Defeating Bias Against Clients on the Basis of National Origin	458
§ 9.4	B.	Successful Negotiation Using the Immigration Consequences of the Conviction	459
§ 9.5	1.	The Legislature has Determined it is Proper for Prosecution and Defense to Renegotiate a Criminal Disposition in Light of the Immigration Consequences	460
§ 9.6	2.	The Proposed Solution is an Appropriate Exercise of Prosecutorial Discretion in the Present Case	461

§ 9.7	3. Sample Negotiation Script.....	462
§ 9.8	C. The Client Should Receive the Benefit of All Reasonable Doubts in These Cases	464
§ 9.9	1. The Immigrant Receives the Benefit of All Reasonable Doubts	465
§ 9.10	2. The Criminal Defendant Receives the Benefit of All Reasonable Doubts.....	465
§ 9.11	III. Appointment of Counsel in Writ Proceedings	467
§ 9.12	IV. Interpreters	468
§ 9.13	A. Selecting an Interpreter.....	468
§ 9.14	B. Using an Interpreter in Court.....	469
§ 9.15	V. Obtaining a Client’s Presence in Court.....	470
§ 9.16	A. Clients in Immigration Custody	470
§ 9.17	B. Clients Who Have Already Been Deported.....	472
§ 9.18	C. Clients Who Have Returned Illegally.....	472
§ 9.19	VI. Obtaining Evidence from the Client After Deportation	473
§ 9.20	VII. Finding Expert Post-Conviction Counsel	475
§ 9.21	A. Finding Post-Conviction Counsel.....	475
§ 9.22	B. Finding Immigration Counsel.....	477

Chapter Ten:

After the Conviction Has Been Vacated: Avoiding Immigration

	Consequences	481
§ 10.1	I. Introduction	482
§ 10.2	II. Documenting the Victory.....	482
§ 10.3	A. Obtaining Certified Copies of the Order Vacating the Conviction or Sentence	483
§ 10.4	B. Correcting FBI Criminal History Reports	483
§ 10.5	C. Correcting State Criminal History Records.....	484
§ 10.6	III. Procedural Rules Governing the New Prosecution.....	484
§ 10.7	A. The Client Cannot be Punished for Exercising the Right to Vacate the Conviction.....	485
§ 10.8	B. The Client Must Be Given Full Credit for All Time Served as a Result of the Original Conviction.....	488

§ 10.9	C.	The Original Judge May be Disqualified at This Point, Even if a Challenge Has Previously Been Employed.....	488
§ 10.10	D.	The Statute of Limitations May Prevent Filing of New Charges at This Point, Even if They Could Lawfully Have Been Filed at the Time of the Original Disposition	489
§ 10.11	IV.	Obtaining a New Outcome that Minimizes Adverse Immigration Consequences	489
§ 10.12	A.	Some Safer Alternative Dispositions	490
§ 10.13	B.	Plea Negotiations.....	492
§ 10.14	C.	Documenting the Disposition for Immigration Counsel	495
§ 10.15	V.	Reopening Removal Proceedings.....	495
§ 10.16	A.	Before Deportation Has Occurred.....	496
§ 10.17	1.	Prior to Removal Order.....	496
§ 10.18	2.	After the Immigration Judge Issues a Removal Order.	496
§ 10.19	3.	During Appeal.....	498
§ 10.20	4.	Motion to Reopen After BIA Dismissal of Appeal	498
§ 10.21	5.	During Petition for Review Proceedings	499
§ 10.22	B.	After Deportation Has Occurred	499
§ 10.23	1.	The BIA Has Jurisdiction to Reopen Proceedings After Deportation if the Conviction Has Been Vacated	500
§ 10.24	2.	Court of Appeals Jurisdiction to Order the Noncitizen to be Readmitted After Conviction Has Been Vacated	503
§ 10.25	3.	Federal Habeas Corpus Seeking Readmission After the Conviction Has Been Vacated.....	504
§ 10.26	4.	Collateral Attack of Deportation Order Upon Prosecution for Illegal Re-entry.....	504

Appendices:

Appendix 1 **Post-Conviction Evaluation Checklist**.....

Appendix 2 **AEDPA Statute of Limitations Worksheet**.....

Appendix 3 **Intake Form**

Appendix 4 **Basic Immigration Status Questionnaire**.....

Other Resources:

- Publications Order Form from Law Offices of Norton Tooby**
- Www.CriminalAndImmigrationLaw.com Website Description**
- Immigrant Legal Resource Center (ILRC) CALIFORNIA CRIMINAL
LAW AND IMMIGRATION ORDER Form**
- ILRC Consultation Services Description**
- National Lawyers Guild IMMIGRATION LAW AND CRIMES Order
Form**
- D. Wilkes, State Post-Conviction Remedies Order Form**

Table of Authorities

Index

About the Author